

**MINUTES OF AN EXTRAORDINARY MEETING OF THE GORE DISTRICT COUNCIL HELD IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 29 CIVIC AVENUE, GORE ON TUESDAY 17 JUNE 2014 AT 4pm.**

**PRESENT** His Worship the Mayor (Mr Tracy Hicks, JP), Crs Beale, Bolger, Byars, Davis, Gover, D Grant, P Grant, Highsted and Page.

**IN ATTENDANCE** The Chief Executive (Mr Stephen Parry), General Manager District Assets (Mr Paul Withers), Roading Manager (Mr Murray Hasler), HR/Administration Manager (Susan Jones), Chief Financial Officer (Mr Luke Blackbeard), Senior Planner (Mr Howard Alchin), Communications Coordinator (Sonia Gerken) and nine members of the public in the gallery.

**APOLOGY** Cr Sharp apologised for absence.

---

**1. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES**

Page 5 – the Council *agreed* to include the following sentence in relation to the submission received from John Gardyne, on page 5, after paragraph 6:

*“Cr Page retracted his comment after he realised he was referring to the wrong document”.*

**RESOLVED** on the motion of Cr P Grant, seconded by Cr D Grant, **THAT** the minutes of the extraordinary meeting of the Gore District Council, held on Monday 9 June 2014, as amended, be confirmed and signed by the Mayor as a true and complete record.

**2. DELIBERATION ON SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED TO DRAFT 2014/15 ANNUAL PLAN (SC0957)**

His Worship advised he would progress through each submission and consider them in a group format. Any decisions would be taken at the time. He called for any conflicts of interest.

Cr D Grant referred to submissions about commercial rates for some property owners. He was a commercial ratepayer which may cause him to have a conflict. His Worship said everyone was a ratepayer. Cr Davis said she was also a commercial ratepayer. Cr Byars was a member of Gore Parents Centre and had to drive down Nicolson Road to get to her home. Cr Highsted was an employee of Tulloch Group.

**Proposed Dog Park**

**Submission 2014/07 – Helen Thomson**

**Submission 2014/09 – Alexander Cruickshank**

**Submission 2014/10 – Graham Butcher**

**Submission 2014/12 – Victoria Mills**

**Submission 2014/14 – Jennifer Jane**  
**Submission 2014/15 – John Barnett**  
**Submission 2014/17 – Gary Weir**  
**Submission 2014/21 – Jacqui Thompson**  
**Submission 2014/26 – Fred Sutherland**  
**Submission 2014/31 – Elmer Curry**  
**Submission 2014/36 – Herb Hannah**  
**Submission 2014/37 – Walter Gee**  
**Submission 2014/41 – Southern District Health board**  
**Submission 2014/42 – Joy Standish**

Cr Beale said he had had a number of ratepayers approach him and most were opposed but enjoyed walking their dogs around Hamilton Park. Some were fearful of losing the chance to walk near the native area that had been planted out. No-one had contributed any money to the proposed park. He did not support it.

Cr Page agreed. Gore was well endowed with parks and reserves.

Cr D Grant referred to the comment from Mr W Gee who opposed a park being established but suggested a seat being erected along the walkway.

Cr P Grant was a member of the Dog Control Working Party but not one cent had been forthcoming from the Kennel Club. He could not support it.

Cr Davis reminded the Council a dog park had been raised at a past annual plan and was referred to the working party. There was no financial support available despite good attempts being made to secure some. There was an area of land near the BMX track which had been set aside in the Council's Long Term Plan and if there was sufficient support in the future from the public, then the land was available.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Beale, seconded by Cr D Grant, THAT the proposed dog park be removed from the draft Annual Plan.**

**2014/42**

**Eccles Street Playground Fence**  
**Submission 2014/09 – Alexander Cruickshank**  
**Submission 2014/11 – John Barnett**  
**Submission 2014/17 – Gary Weir**  
**Submission 2014/21 – Jacqui Thompson**  
**Submission 2014/27 – Fred Sutherland**  
**Submission 2014/33 – Elmer Curry**  
**Submission 2014/41 – Southern District Health Board**  
**Submission 2014/49 – Anne and David Hunt**  
**Submission 2014/53 – Gore Parents Centre**  
**Submission 2014/58 – Anne Fotheringham**  
**Submission 2014/63 – Brenda Duncan**

Submitters had provided comment on fencing off a proportion of the Eccles Street playground to provide a safer environment for small children.

His Worship advised Gore Parents Centre had circulated a petition that had generated 168 signatures to date. There were 146 signatures from those who were not members of Parents Centre.

Cr Bolger was inclined to support the fence. He referred to the Mataura Plunket playground at Queen's Park that had a fence around it. He felt there was some danger to small children at the Eccles Street playground.

Cr Gover opposed it. Her children had played at it and her grandchildren also did. The playground was not really suitable for small children anyway. She believed New Zealand society had become too PC. In Australia, there were signs at playgrounds stating "young children are your responsibility." The onus should be placed back on parents if they felt the playground was too unsafe. There was no piece of equipment that could necessitate a child being too close to the road.

Cr Highsted thought society had changed and there were a number of grandparents who now looked after grandchildren. In terms of encouraging people to get out and about, fencing the playground was his preference. The care of children had changed.

Cr D Grant was in favour. The entire playground would not be fenced, it was just protecting the infant areas and he felt \$13,000 was not a lot of money to protect young children.

Cr P Grant supported a fence. The playground was near the busiest road in Gore. He would rather see the playground fenced and children protected than fence an area for dogs.

Cr Beale thought a sign should be erected for parents and grandparents to leave their phones in the car and actually watch the children.

Cr Davis had not supported the fence initially but had been persuaded it was for the best. It was a very busy playground with fast food outlets nearby. There were a lot of families who used it. Families today were a lot different to those from a few years ago. It was a special case because of its location and the intersections near it.

Cr Page said granddads were slower than dads and he thought if it was fenced it would be used more because it was safer.

His Worship said he had spent a bit of time at the playground in Mataura that had a fence around it and he personally preferred to take his grandchildren to Mataura knowing they were secure than go to the Eccles Street playground. It gave slower grandparents a degree of comfort.

Cr Gover was concerned the fence was going to be only around a small area. A child in the smaller area could climb outside the area. She could see another request coming for the entire area to be fenced.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr D Grant, seconded by Cr P Grant, THAT fencing off a proportion of the Eccles Street playground at an estimated cost of \$13,000, be included in the 2014/15 annual plan.**

**2014/43**

Cr Gover voted against and asked for her vote to be recorded.

#### **Submission 2014/01 – Hospice Southland**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Davis, seconded by Cr Highsted, THAT a grant of \$1,000 be approved.**

**2014/44**

#### **Submission 2014/02 – Physicians and Scientists for Global Responsibility**

Cr Bolger was uncomfortable with fluoridation on a large scale as it took away individual choice.

Cr Beale agreed and said it had been done to death 12 years ago. It was not hard to find more cities in the world who were removing fluoridation from water supplies than adding it. The Gore District had a population approaching 20% of people who were aged 60 years and above and there was conclusive evidence that fluoride affected that age group.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr Beale, THAT no further consideration be given to introducing fluoride to the Gore and Mataura water supplies.**

**2014/45**

#### **Submission 2014/03 – Renewables Motueka**

Cr Davis asked if the information the submitter had said he would send had done so.

His Worship advised he had.

Cr D Grant did not think it was the Council's business.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr D Grant, seconded by Cr Davis, THAT the submission be received.**

**2014/46**

**Submission 2014/04 – Eastern Southland Basketball Association**

Cr Bolger felt the Council supported basketball in kind via the MLT Event Centre.

Cr P Grant thought the association needed to relocate to the event centre.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr Davis, THAT the Council enter into dialogue with the association but no financial assistance be offered.**

**2014/47**

**Submission 2014/05 – Southland Warm Homes Trust**

Cr Gover felt the Council should continue to support the Trust. The Gore District had problems with its air quality and financial assistance would help with the insulation of homes. Both Southland District and Invercargill City had agreed to continue with its support with the Trust.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Gover, seconded by Cr Highsted, THAT the Council approve a grant of \$15,000 for the 2014/15 year,**

**AND THAT continued involvement be reviewed in 12 months time.**

**2014/48**

Cr Beale said with no provision in the annual plan, where would be money come from.

His Worship said it would have to be rated for as it had been in the past.

**Submission 2014/06 – Democrats for Social Credit**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Davis, seconded by Cr D Grant, THAT the submission be received and noted.**

**2014/49**

**Submission 2014/08 – John Watkins**

Cr Highsted felt the issue was well and truly on the Council's radar.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Highsted, seconded by Cr Page THAT the submission be received,**

**AND THAT Mr Watkins be advised of the work being undertaken by the Council.**

**2014/50**

**Submission 2014/13 – Andrew and Heather Tripp**

**Submission 2014/49 – Anne and David Hunt**

**Submission 2014/54 – Bernadette Hunt**

Cr Davis asked if a recycling service progressed along the lines of the comments received from the General Manager District Assets would it be funded by rural ratepayers.

His Worship said it would.

In response to Cr Beale, the General Manager said the \$15,000 cost was a one-off for establishment.

In response to Cr Highsted, the General Manager said the containers were a fair proportion of the cost.

Cr Highsted asked if there was an opportunity to trial wheelie bins inside the transfer station to gauge usage by rural ratepayers.

The General Manager said if the Council was of a mind 240 litre bins could be placed into a container.

Cr Davis thought it was a good idea, but it had not been signalled as part of the annual plan. It would have to be funded by rural ratepayers. She would be more comfortable if it was included in next year's annual plan to enable full consultation to take place.

Cr Bolger said for those people who wanted to save the planet and recycle, good on them. If recycling was supposed to live up to its reputation then it should be able to support itself. Paddy's Bins could offer a recycling service if it wanted. The Council should not be offering the service.

Cr Byars was new to the rural area and would like to be able to recycle, but thought rural residents needed to be asked.

**Cr Davis moved THAT the Council consider the inclusion of recycling for rural ratepayers in its 2015/16 draft annual plan, to enable full consultation to be undertaken with the rural community.**

**The motion was seconded by Cr Byars.**

**Cr Bolger moved as an amendment THAT no further action be taken.**

**The amendment lapsed for want of a seconder.**

**The motion was put and it was carried.**

**Cr Bolger voted against the motion and asked for his vote to be recorded.**

**2014/51**

#### **Submission 2014/16 – Environment Southland**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Davis, seconded by Cr Page, THAT the updated status of the employment of Civil Defence and Emergency Management staff be noted and the final plan amended to take cognisance of the change.**

**2014/52**

#### **Submission 2014/18 – Enviroschools Foundation**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Gover, seconded by Cr Byars, THAT the submission be noted.**

**2014/53**

#### **Submission 2014/19 – Trevor and Trish Chapman**

His Worship said Local Government New Zealand had petitioned the Government about this issue and it had said it would consider it but it appeared to be on the back burner. Because of the ownership nature of the retirement villages nothing could be done at this point.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr Gover, THAT the Council communicate with the Minister of Internal Affairs requesting changes to be made to the rates rebate scheme.**

**2014/54**

#### **Submission 2014/20 – Community Networking Trust**

His Worship had seen many benefits arise from the position in Maitua.

Cr Davis commended the work undertaken by Jo Brand and thought it had made a difference to the community. However in her opinion, putting money into the position was crossing the line between central and local government. She did not think she could support it.

Cr Bolger said there had been some great work done. He would hate to see the momentum lost and Maitua needed that role. Maitua people were ratepayers and would share in the contribution. He saw it as an investment in that community.

Cr D Grant concurred with Cr Bolger. Perhaps the Council could assist with some funding. He thought the position needed to be maintained.

Cr Highsted asked if there was a place for a role closer to the Council that it could have input into. He was not sure the ideal outcome would be achieved by putting a small amount into a \$50,000 budget.

His Worship said he would be surprised if there was an expectation for \$50,000 from the Council. All communities had their challenges and the challenge in Maitua was

around areas of deprivation. Mataura school was the only decile one school south of Christchurch. There were a lot of good things happening there mainly stemming from the community development role. He thought \$10,000 could be provided by the Council.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Highsted, seconded by Cr Gover, THAT the Council contribute \$10,000 to retaining the community development coordinator position in Mataura, subject to a commitment to funding being received from other providers.**

**2014/55**

Cr Davis voted against the motion and asked for it to be recorded.

**Submission 2014/22 – Ross Baird**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Page, seconded by Cr D Grant, THAT the submission be noted.**

**2014/56**

**Submission 2014/23 – Foodstuffs South Island Properties Ltd**

**Submission 2014/24 – Aroha Early Centre**

**Submission 2014/28 – Bruce Muir**

**Submission 2014/35 – Oakleigh Motels**

**Submission 2014/39 – Tulloch Group**

**Submission 2014/57 – United Video Gore**

Cr Highsted understood the parks and reserves rate was capped on higher value properties. Foodstuffs was a large company and one of the larger employers in the Gore District community. He felt the cap was probably favouring it.

His Worship said there were some property owners who would benefit more than others.

Cr Beale said perhaps the cap was too low for some of the higher valued properties. Some higher value ratepayers may not know when they were well off.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Beale, seconded by Cr Bolger, THAT the submissions be received,**

**AND THAT the parks and reserves cap be retained.**

**2014/57**

**Submission 2014/25 – Waikaka Hall Society**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr Byars, THAT the local rate for the Waikaka Hall be increased to \$45 per property.**

**2014/58**

### **Submission 2014/30 – Gavin and Leanne Grant**

Cr Bolger said while it was desirable to have sealed roads it was simply not affordable for the Council to seal 2km of Nicholson Road.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr P Grant, THAT the status quo be retained.**

**2014/59**

In response to Cr Highsted, the Roading Manager said the latest vehicle count on that road was 41 per day. The last road that had seal extension had recorded at least 80 vehicles per day. If the Council did resume seal extensions there would be other roads that would take priority.

In response to Cr Beale, the Manager said the Council issued permits to oil short sections of road for dust suppression purposes in the summer months. There were conditions imposed on permit holders.

The Chief Executive said the beneficiary of a potential seal extension could stand in the shoes of NZTA and provide the equivalent of an NZTA subsidy and the Council could assist with the local share.

In response to Cr Byars, the Manager advised the estimate of cost to seal 2km of the road would be around \$520,000. It also significantly increased the cost of maintaining a road.

Cr Byars said the road was very wide and there was an expectation of some residents that it had been widened for sealing.

His Worship said the rules were about to change again with the one network classification which may provide an opportunity to consult with rural residents.

In response to Cr P Grant, the Manager said the former Southland County Council had plans to seal that road prior to the 1989 local government reorganisation. He added he would review the shape of the road which would assist with maintaining better condition of it.

### **Submission 2014/32 – Elmer Curry**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Davis, seconded by Cr Highsted, THAT the submission be noted.**

**2014/60**

### **Submission 2014/34 – Southern Primary Health Organisation**

Cr Gover wondered if more education and publicity needed to be given to the smoke-free signs located at playgrounds.

Cr Highsted said the Council had invested in the signage and did not want to see ratepayer money go into advertising campaigns.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Highsted, seconded by Cr D Grant, THAT the submission be received.**

**2014/61**

**Submission 2014/48 – John Gardyne**

Cr Bolger was concerned at the submission and perhaps it was the way it had been reported in the newspaper. He had been a Councillor for 15 years and had been a rural representative before he was a District Wide Councillor. The Gore District rating mechanism has been refined and he thought it was probably the most rural rating friendly mechanism in the country. Federated Farmers had been asked to find a better one. A suggestion that rural people in the Gore District were disadvantaged in favour of urban people was absolutely incorrect. He had no doubt about that yet every year there was a submission from Federated Farmers who were not happy. He looked at the 2010-11 year when rural people had a .87% rate decrease. Still people were not happy. The examples in the draft annual plan and what had not been mentioned in the submission was the substantial increase in valuation of some properties. To say rural people were getting a 7 or 8% rate increase was just not correct. The context of examples provided needed to be acknowledged. It was the Councillors job to find the fairest mechanism for all ratepayers it could. Referring to debt, he said debt was substantially urban debt, not rural. He added he could not remember a group of urban submitters coming along asking for more rates to be pushed out to the rural area. He felt there needed to be more moderation.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr Highsted, THAT the submission be received.**

**2014/62**

**Submission 2014/40 – Willowbank School**

**Submission 2014/43 – Pukerau School**

Cr Davis said the book bus serviced the rural area. Had there been any thought given as to how it would be funded?

The Chief Executive had not turned his mind as to whether rural ratepayers would need to fund it exclusively. The other option was to include it in the grants area where some grants were specifically for rural activities, such as the rural halls and domains grant. A specialised targeted rate could be established. It was not a huge sum.

Cr Beale said it equated to about \$1.40 per ratepayer.

Cr Byars supported the request and it was a small amount of money to encourage children to read.

**RESOLVED** on the motion of Cr Beale, seconded by Cr Gover, **THAT** the sum of \$9,000 be included in the annual plan to retain the book bus service in Willowbank, Pukerau and Waikaka.

2014/63

**Submission 2014/41 - Southland District Health Board**

**RESOLVED** on the motion of Cr Gover, seconded by Cr D Grant, **THAT** the recommendation of the submitter to amend the wording in the levels of service, performance levels and targets for 2014/15 on the regulation of alcohol be adopted.

2014/64

**Submission 2014/44 – Hokonui Trails Trust**

Cr Bolger felt any initiative that encouraged people to come to Gore as a destination was worth supporting.

Cr Page said the group had already raised \$80,000 which was an excellent effort.

Cr Davis supported the establishment of the trail and she noted there was going to be a trust established so there would not be any impost for future maintenance purposes. Perhaps there were other ways to assist rather than providing cash.

**Cr Bolger moved THAT that a contribution of \$5,000 be provided primarily in kind if possible.**

**The motion was seconded by Cr P Grant.**

In response to Cr Highsted, the Chief Executive said assistance in kind could be provided but the costs of whatever was provided would have to met from a budget.

Cr Bolger said the Council could provide pipes for example and claim the GST which then decreased the costs for the trust.

The Chief Executive said providing items in kind could have financial implications with the IRD which the Council needed to be mindful of.

**The motion was put and it was carried.**

2014/65

**Submission 2014/46 – The New Zealand Automobile Association Inc.**

**RESOLVED** on the motion of Cr Highsted, seconded by Cr D Grant, **THAT** the submission be noted.

2014/66

#### **Submission 2014/46 – Graeme Keown**

In response to Cr Bolger, the Chief Executive was not sure the properties were contiguous in order for the UAGC to not be charged.

Cr Beale asked if Mr Keown had considered adding a section to his existing property.

Mr Keown had discussed it but it was not that simple and if they were all in one title they could not be sold.

His Worship was not sure the Council could do much with this particular issue this year but certainly when the Long Term Plan was considered it needed to be reviewed, particularly with lower valued properties in Gore and Mataura.

The Chief Executive confirmed the properties were not contiguous.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr Page, THAT the submission be received.**

**2014/67**

#### **Submission 2014/47 – Archer Corporation**

An additional paper from the Archer Corporation was tabled at the meeting.

The Chief Executive said previously the former General Manager Corporate Services had done a lot of amendment to rating tiers to endeavour to have a similar number in each tier. Some years ago there was some change to about \$20,000 of rating liability and that resulted in commercial ratepayers paying 26% of parks and reserves rates. This year it was 27% in accordance with the Council policy. Through the smoothing process, that anomaly had been addressed.

The Chief Executive said the \$90,000 was the actual reduction in the parks and reserves rate.

#### **Submission 2014/48 – Combined Lions Clubs of Gore and Mataura**

Cr Bolger said service clubs had to be supported.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr Gover, THAT the Council approve a grant of \$5,000 towards a feasibility study provided funding from other providers was obtained.**

**2014/68**

#### **Submission 2014/51 – Peter Hargest and Mark Copland**

Cr Bolger said the submitters had suggested the Council investigate amalgamation and he was not sure that was the Council's role. He was not sure they were aware of the huge amount of work being done with shared services in Southland. He thought

it was a very risky statement to suggest amalgamating with another local authority without any facts and figures. When the figures were reviewed with Clutha District the rate per ratepayer was higher there than in the Gore District. The ratepayer in Gore was better off.

His Worship said he had posed the question to the submitters about what they thought the Council's role should be which resulted in their thinking there should be a referendum. It was not the Council's job and it should butt out. Any push for amalgamation should come from the community.

His Worship said there had only been one successful amalgamation since 1989 and that was Banks Peninsula and Christchurch City. In 20 year's time people may be able to determine whether the creation of the Auckland Council was delivering cheaper or better services, but he doubted it would be cheaper.

Cr Page did not think a referendum was any sort of option.

Cr Davis thought more useful in the future would be a cost-benefit analysis rather than a referendum. It was not the right vehicle to pose a question such as amalgamation.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr P Grant, THAT the submission be received.**

**2014/69**

**Submission 2014/52 – Poppycock Trust**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr D Grant, seconded by Cr Davis, THAT the request be received.**

**2014/70**

**Submission 2014/55 – Sally McIntyre**

**Submission 2014/56 – Sally McIntyre**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Davis, seconded by Cr Bolger, THAT the submissions be received.**

**2014/71**

Cr Bolger said it would be nice if someone acknowledged the work of the finance staff for the interest rates achieved. He thanked them.

**Submission 2014/59 – Sport Southland**

Cr Bolger admired the vision of Sport Southland for another stage at the multi-sports complex.

Cr Davis agreed and said the enthusiasm was commendable.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Davis, seconded by Cr Gover, THAT the Council support facilitation by Sport Southland for the purchase and installation of units for a fitness/leisure track based at the Gore multisports complex.**

**2014/72**

**Submission 2014/60 – Eastern Southland Federated Farmers**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Bolger, seconded by Cr Highsted, THAT the submission be received.**

**2014/73**

**Submission 2014/61 – Federated Farmers of New Zealand**

Cr Highsted asked if anything had been received following a request for Federated Farmers to provide examples of better rating systems.

His Worship advised nothing had been received.

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Page, seconded by Cr P Grant, THAT the submission be received.**

**2014/74**

**Submission 2014/62 – Haumuri Retreat**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr D Grant, seconded by Cr Beale, THAT the submission be received.**

**2014/75**

**Submission 2014/64 - Southern Cross Advisers Ltd**

**RESOLVED on the motion of Cr Davis, seconded by Cr P Grant, THAT the submission be noted.**

**2014/76**

His Worship thanked Councillors for their input into the annual planning process.

The Chief Executive said the Council would consider adopting the draft annual plan at its meeting on 24 June and the 2014/15 rates resolution would also be included on the agenda.

The meeting concluded at 5:48pm